

Independent response: A library recommendation board

Original fictional instructional scenario; the people and events are invented.

In a fictional school, students propose a recommendation board near the library entrance so readers can discover books classmates enjoy.

Sam: Wall space is limited, and keeping a weekly board current would take time. A student might see a recommended title but find no copy available. A small rotating shelf display updated less often could be another option.

Independent response

Write 4–6 sentences responding to Sam. Choose at least one of Sam’s main concerns to answer. State that concern and Sam’s alternative fairly, in a way Sam could recognize. You do not need to include every concern for full credit. Acknowledge why the concern matters, then answer it with a connected reason, practical plan, qualification, or limit. Use or adapt the writing frame from the guided response, then check your work with the four-part rubric below. You may support the board, suggest a smaller or less frequent display, or argue for Sam’s shelf option. Name one concern your answer does not solve. Do not add an extreme motive or score the argument by whether you agree with the original proposal.

Four-part response rubric

Fair representation — 2: Accurately states at least one main concern and Sam’s alternative. Other concerns may be omitted. 1: Identifies a main concern but omits the alternative or partly misstates the concern or alternative. 0: Does not identify a relevant concern or substantially changes Sam’s view.

Acknowledgment and connection — 2: Explains why the selected concern matters and makes a clear link between the reply and that concern. 1: Does one of those two things clearly, but not both. 0: Does neither clearly.

Reasoned response and limit — 2: Gives a related reason, plan, agreement, or qualification and names a remaining limit. 1: Gives a related response or a limit, but not both. 0: Gives neither.

Clear reasoning — 2: The reasoning is easy to follow. 1: The main idea is partly clear. 0: The reasoning is not yet clear. Your score does not depend on which option you support. Total: 0–8 points.

Independent response planner

Use Sam's exchange to plan a fair response. You may support either option. Name the concern accurately, acknowledge why it matters, connect your response to it, and note what remains unresolved.

Sam's concern and alternative, stated fairly

Why does the concern matter?

My connected reason, plan, qualification, or agreement

How does my response address Sam's concern?

What might my response still not solve?

Draft a 4-6 sentence reply
